Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b) June 22, 2020 7:50 AM EPA Region 4, Regional Hearing Clerk

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 4 ATLANTA, GEORGIA

In the Matter of:	
Troy Corporation	Do
Respondent.	

Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

CONSENT AGREEMENT

I. NATURE OF ACTION

- This is an administrative penalty assessment proceeding brought under Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a) (FIFRA or the Act), and Sections 22.13(b) and 22.18 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), as codified at Title 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations (C.F.R.) Part 22.
- 2. This Consent Agreement and the attached Final Order shall collectively be referred to as the CAFO.
- 3. Having found that settlement is consistent with the provisions of FIFRA and applicable regulations, the Parties have agreed to settle this action pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18 and consent to the entry of this CAFO without adjudication of any issues of law or fact herein.

II. PARTIES

4. Complainant is the Director of the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, who has been delegated the authority on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to enter into this CAFO pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 22 and Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a).

5. Respondent is **Troy Corporation**, a corporation doing business in the State of New Jersey, and which imports products into Region 4 Ports of Entry. Respondent's f acility is located at 8 Vreeland Road, Florham Park, New Jersey 07932. This proceeding pertains to product imported by Respondent into the Port of Charleston, South Carolina.

III. GOVERNING LAW

- 6. The term "pesticide" is defined by Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C § 136(u), to mean any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling or mitigating any pest.
- 7. A "pest" is defined in Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), as any insect, rodent, nematode, fungus, weed, or any other form of terrestrial or aquatic plant or animal life or virus, bacteria, or other micro-organism (except viruses, bacteria, or other microorganisms on or in living man or other living animals) which the Administrator declares to be a pest under Section 25(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136w(c)(1).
- 8. The term "establishment" is defined in Section 2(dd) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(dd) and 40 C.F.R. § 167.3, to mean any place where a pesticide or device or active ingredient used in producing a pesticide is produced, or held, for distribution or sale.
- 9. Pursuant to Section 2(q)(1)(D) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(E), a pesticide is misbranded if its label does not bear the registration number assigned under section 7 to each establishment in which it was produced.
- 10. Pursuant to Section 2(q)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(E), a pesticide is misbranded if any word, statement, or other information required by or under authority of FIFRA to appear on the label or labeling is not prominently placed thereon with such conspicuousness (as compared with other words, statements, designs, or graphic matter in the labeling) and in such terms as to render it likely to be read and understood by the ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase and use.
- 11. Pursuant to Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), it is unlawful for any person in any State to distribute or sell to any person any pesticide which is misbranded.
- 12. The term "to distribute or sell" as defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg) and 40 C.F.R. § 152.3, includes to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, or "release for shipment".
- 13. Pursuant to Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), it shall be unlawful for any person to violate any regulation issued under Section 3(a) or 19.
- 14. Pursuant to Section 19(a)(1)(B) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(B), The Administrator may require that the labeling of a pesticide contain requirements and procedures for the transportation, storage and disposal of the pesticide, any container of the pesticide, any rinsate containing the pesticide, or any other material used to contain or collect excess or spilled quantities of the pesticide.
- 15. The term "to distribute or sell" as defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg)

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 2 of 14

and 40 C.F.R. § 152.3, includes to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, or "release for shipment".

- 16. Pursuant to Section 17(c) FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c) and the regulations at 19 C.F.R. § 12.112, an importer desiring to ship pesticides or pesticide devices into the United States is required to submit to the EPA Administrator a Notice of Arrival of Pesticides and Devices (NOA) [EPA Form 3540-1], prior to the arrival of the shipment(s) into the United States, or, as an alternative to submitting an NOA, the importer or its agent may file an entry via the U.S. Customs and Border Protection's (CBP) Automated Commercial Environment (ACE) Data Processing System.
- 17. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a) may be assessed by administrative order.

IV. FINDINGS OF FACTS

- 18. Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- On or around March 29, 2019, Cavalier International Air Freight, Inc. the licensed customs broker for Troy, filed an NOA in the U.S. CBP ACE system for the importation of 40 bags of Troysan ZPT Technical (EPA Reg. No. 365-91), each weighing 400 kilograms, which arrived at the Port of Charleston, South Carolina under entry number HTD-93415976 on or around March 29, 2019.
- 20. Upon review of the label, the EPA determined that the product was misbranded in that the pesticide product arrived in supersacks and at the time of arrival, neither the EPA-approved Master label nor the label affixed to the product included Container Handling language for the disposal of the container of the pesticide in supersacks as required under FIFRA Section 19(a) and 40 C.F.R. § 156.144 (and as interpreted by the EPA in Pesticide Registration Notice 83-3).
- 21. On April 12, 2019, the EPA conditionally released the products to allow the Respondent to have the products relabeled at CRI Tolling, LLC, an EPA-registered establishment [EPA Establishment Number 81981-SC-1], located at 300 International Boulevard, Fountain Inn, South Carolina 29644.
- 22. On June 5, 2019, after verifying that Troy had relabeled the bags in compliance with FIFRA, the EPA fully released the 40 bags of Troysan ZPT Technical for use and distribution.
- 23. On or around September 19, 2019, Cavalier International Air Freight, Inc., filed an NOA in the CBP ACE system, on behalf of Troy, for the importation of 15 totes, weighing 1,250 kilograms each, of Mergal Mitz (EPA Reg. No. 365-84), which arrived at the Port of Charleston, South Carolina under entry number HTD-93421255 on or around September 20, 2019.

- 24. Upon review of the copy of the label for Mergal Mitz that was uploaded to DIS as representative of the label on the product, the EPA determined that the product was misbranded in that the label did not include the net weight in pounds as required by 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(d).
- 25. In a letter dated September 26, 2019, Troy informed the EPA of three additional shipments of Mergal Mitz, that included the same misbranded labeling as described in paragraph 24, being imported through the Port of South Carolina under entry numbers HTD-93422162, HTD-93422154, and HTD-93422147. Each shipment contained 15 totes of Mergal Mitz, weighing 1,250 kilograms each.
- 26. On September 26, 2019, entry number HTD-93421255 was conditionally released to allow the product to be moved to CRI Tolling for relabeling. On October 15, 2019, entry numbers HTD-93422162, HTD-93422154, and HTD-93422147 were also conditionally released to allow the products to be moved to CRI Tolling for relabeling.
- 27. Upon review of the photographs submitted by Troy Corporation as representative of the condition of the products as they arrived at CRI Tolling, the product labels in all four shipments of Mergal Mitz did not appear to match what was originally presented to the EPA. Specifically, the product labels appeared to be an older version of the label which omitted possible uses, did not include the net weight, and listed an incorrect EPA Establishment number. Despite these differences, Troy was allowed to relabel all 60 totes with the most recently approved EPA-master label.
- 28. After verifying that Troy had relabeled the totes in compliance with FIFRA, all 60 totes of Mergal Mitz were released for use and distribution between October and November 2019.

V. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

- 29. The EPA alleges that by importing the pesticide product Troysan ZPT Technical, as described above, in supersacks instead of bags, and without appropriate container handling language for disposal on the labels, Troy Corporation violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), on at least one occasion and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*.
- 30. The EPA alleges that by importing the misbranded pesticide product Mergal Mitz, as described above, Troy Corporation violated Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), on at least four occasions and is therefore subject to the assessment of a civil penalty under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a).
- 31. Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a), in conjunction with 40 C.F.R. Part 19, Adjustments of Civil Monetary Penalties for Inflation, authorizes the assessment of a civil penalty.

Page 4 of 14

VI. STIPULATIONS

- 32. The issuance of this CAFO simultaneously commences and concludes this proceeding. 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b).
- 33. For the purpose of this proceeding, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(b)(2), Respondent:
 - (a) admits that the EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter alleged in this CAFO;
 - (b) neither admits nor denies the factual allegations set forth in Section IV (Findings of Facts) of this CAFO;
 - (c) consents to the assessment of a civil penalty as stated below;
 - (d) consents to the conditions specified in this CAFO;
 - (e) waives any right to contest the alleged violations of law set forth in Section V (Alleged Violations) of this CAFO; and
 - (f) waives its rights to appeal the Final Order accompanying this CAFO.
- 34. For the purpose of this proceeding, Respondent:
 - (a) agrees that this CAFO states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Respondent;
 - (b) acknowledges that this CAFO constitutes an enforcement action for purposes of considering Respondent's compliance history in any subsequent enforcement actions;
 - (c) waives any right it may possess at law or in equity to challenge the authority of the EPA to bring a civil action in a United States District Court to compel compliance with the CAFO, and to seek an additional penalty for such noncompliance, and agrees that federal law shall govern in any such civil action;
 - (d) by executing this CAFO, certifies to the best of its knowledge that Respondent is currently in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA and its implementing regulations, and that all violations alleged herein, which are neither admitted nor denied, have been corrected;
 - (e) waives any right it may have pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.8 to be present during any discussions with, or to be served with and reply to, any memorandum or communication addressed to the EPA officials where the purpose of such discussion, memorandum, or communication is to persuade such official to accept or issue this CAFO; and
 - (f) agrees to comply with the terms of this CAFO.

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page **5** of **14**

35. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.5, the individuals named in the certificate of service are authorized to receive service related to this proceeding and the parties agree to receive service by electronic means at the following valid email addresses: ho.kanoelehua@epa.gov and caplan.robert@epa.gov for the EPA and krygsmaA@troycorp.com for the Respondent.

VII. TERMS OF PAYMENT

- 36. Respondent consents to the payment of a civil penalty, which was calculated in accordance with the Act, in the amount of \$15,000.00, which is to be paid within thirty (30) calendar days of the Effective Date of this CAFO.
- 37. Payment(s) shall be made by cashier's check, certified check, by electronic funds transfer (EFT), or by Automated Clearing House (ACH) (also known as REX or remittance express). If paying by check, the check shall be payable to: Treasurer, United States of America, and the Facility name and docket number for this matter shall be referenced on the face of the check. If Respondent sends payment by the U.S. Postal Service, the payment shall be addressed to:

United States Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

If Respondent sends payment by non-U.S. Postal express mail delivery, the payment shall be sent to:

U.S. Bank Government Lockbox 979077 U.S. EPA Fines & Penalties 1005 Convention Plaza Mail Station: SL-MO-C2-GL St. Louis, Missouri 63101 Contact Number: (314) 425-1819

If paying by EFT, Respondent shall transfer the payment to:

Federal Reserve Bank of New York ABA: 021030004 Account Number: 68010727 SWIFT address: FRNYUS33 33 Liberty Street New York, New York 10045 Field Tag 4200 of the Fedwire message should read: "D 68010727 Environmental Protection Agency"

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 6 of 14

If paying by ACH, Respondent shall remit payment to:

US Treasury REX / Cashlink ACH Receiver ABA: 051036706 Account Number: 310006, Environmental Protection Agency CTX Format Transaction Code 22 – checking Physical location of US Treasury facility: 5700 Rivertech Court Riverdale, Maryland 20737 Contact: Craig Steffen (513) 487-2091 REX (Remittance Express): 1-866-234-5681

38. Respondent shall send proof of payment within 24 hours of payment of the civil penalty, to:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960

and

Kanoelehua Ho Chemical Safety Section Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 ho.kanoelehua@epa.gov

- 39. "Proof of payment" means, as applicable, a copy of the check, confirmation of credit card or debit card payment, confirmation of wire or automated clearinghouse transfer, and any other information required to demonstrate that payment has been made according to the EPA requirements, in the amount due, and identified with the Facility name and Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b).
- 40. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717, 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11, if Respondent fails to remit the civil penalty as agreed to herein, the EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the costs of processing and handling the delinquent claim. Accordingly, the EPA may require the Respondent to pay the following amounts on any amount overdue:
 - (a) <u>Interest</u>. Interest will begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the Effective Date of this CAFO from the date that the EPA first mails notice to the Respondent that a stipulated penalty is due], Interest will continue to accrue on any unpaid portion until the unpaid portion of the penalty and accrued Interest is paid. Interest will be assessed at the rate of the United States Treasury tax and loan rate, as established by the

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 7 of 14

Secretary of the Treasury, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 3717(a)(1), 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(b), and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a).

- (b) <u>Non-Payment Penalty</u>. On any portion of a civil penalty more than ninety (90) calendar days past due, Respondent must pay a non-payment penalty of not more than six percent (6%) per annum, which will accrue from the date the penalty payment became due and is not paid, as provided in 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2) and 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(d). This non-payment penalty is in addition to charges which accrue or may accrue under subparagraphs (a) and (c) and will be assessed monthly. 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(c).
- (c) Monthly Handling Charge. Respondent must pay a late payment handling charge to cover the administrative costs of processing and handling the delinquent claim, based on either actual or average cost incurred. 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(c), and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b). Administrative costs will be assessed monthly throughout the period the debt is overdue except as provided by 40 C.F.R. § 13.12.
- 41. If Respondent fails to timely pay any portion of the penalty assessed under this CAFO, pursuant to Section 14 (a)(5) of FIFRA 7 U.S.C.§ 136*l*(a)(5), the EPA may:
 - (a) refer the debt to a credit reporting agency or a collection agency pursuant to Section 14(a) of FIFRA 7 U.S.C.§ *136l*(a), 40 C.F.R. §§ 13.13 and 13.14;
 - (b) collect the debt by administrative offset (i.e., the withholding of money payable by the United States to, or held by the United States for, a person to satisfy the debt the person owes the Government), which includes, but is not limited to, referral to the Internal Revenue Service for offset against income tax refunds, 40 C.F.R. Part 13, Subparts C and H;
 - (c) suspend or revoke Respondent's licenses or other privileges, or suspend or disqualify Respondent from doing business with the EPA or engaging in programs the EPA sponsors or funds, 40 C.F.R. § 13.17; and/or
 - (d) request that the Attorney General bring a civil action in the appropriate district court to recover the amount assessed pursuant to Section 14(a)(5) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C.§ 136l(a)(5).
- 42. Penalties paid pursuant to this CAFO shall not be deductible for purposes of federal taxes.

VIII. EFFECT OF CAFO

- 43. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c), Respondent's full compliance with this CAFO shall only resolve Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts specifically alleged above.
- 44. Full payment of the civil penalty, as provided in Section VII (Terms of Payment), shall not in any case affect the right of the EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 8 of 14

injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law. 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c)

- 45. Nothing in this CAFO shall relieve Respondent of the duty to comply with all applicable provisions of FIFRA and other federal, state, or local laws or statutes, nor shall it restrict the EPA's authority to seek compliance with any applicable laws or regulations, nor shall it be construed to be a ruling on, or determination of, any issue related to any federal, state, or local permit, except as expressly provided herein.
- 46. Nothing herein shall be construed to limit the power of the EPA to undertake any action against Respondent or any person in response to conditions that may present an imminent and substantial endangerment as provided under the Act.
- 47. The terms, conditions, and compliance requirements of this CAFO may not be modified or amended except upon the written agreement of both Parties, and approval of the Regional Judicial Officer.
- 48. The provisions of this CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and its officers, directors, employees, agents, trustees, servants, authorized representatives, successors, and assigns.
- 49. Any change in the legal status of the Respondent, or change in ownership, partnership, corporate or legal status relating to the Facility, will not in any way alter Respondent's obligations and responsibilities under this CAFO.
- 50. By signing this Consent Agreement, Respondent acknowledges that this CAFO will be available to the public and agrees that this CAFO does not contain any confidential business information or personally identifiable information.
- 51. By signing this Consent Agreement, the Complainant and the undersigned representative of Respondent each certify that he or she is fully authorized to execute and enter into the terms and conditions of this CAFO and has the legal capacity to bind the party he or she represents to this CAFO.
- 52. By signing this Consent Agreement, both Parties agree that each party's obligations under this CAFO constitute sufficient consideration for the other party's obligations.
- 53. By signing this Consent Agreement, Respondent certifies that the information it has supplied concerning this matter was at the time of submission, and continues to be, true, accurate, and complete for each such submission, response, and statement. Respondent acknowledges that there are significant penalties for submitting false or misleading information, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing submission of such information, under 18 U.S.C. § 1001.
- 54. The EPA also reserves the right to revoke this CAFO and settlement penalty if and to the extent that the EPA finds, after signing this CAFO, that any information provided by Respondent was materially false or inaccurate at the time such information was provided to the EPA. If such false or inaccurate material was provided, the EPA

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page **9** of **14**

reserves the right to assess and collect any and all civil penalties for any violation described herein. The EPA shall give Respondent notice of its intent to revoke, which shall not be effective until received by Respondent in writing.

- 55. It is the intent of the parties that the provisions of this CAFO are severable. If any provision or authority of this CAFO or the application of this CAFO to any party or circumstances is held by any judicial or administrative authority to be invalid or unenforceable, the application of such provisions to other parties or circumstances and the remainder of the CAFO shall remain in force and shall not be affected thereby.
- 56. Unless specifically stated otherwise in this CAFO, each party shall bear its own attorney's fees, costs, and disbursements incurred in this proceeding.

IX. EFFECTIVE DATE

57. This CAFO shall become effective upon execution of the Final Order by the Regional Judicial Officer on the date of filing with the Hearing Clerk.

[Remainder of Page Intentionally Left Blank

Complainant and Respondent will Each Sign on Separate Pages]

The foregoing Consent Agreement In the Matter of **Troy Corporation**, Docket Number **FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)** Is Hereby Stipulated, Agreed and Approved for Entry.

FOR RESPONDENT:

adria	rygon 5/06/2020
Signature	Date /
Printed Name: _	Adrian Krygsman
Title:	DIRECTOR, PRODUCT REGISTRATION
Address: _	8 VREELAND ROAD
	FLORMAN PARK, N.J. 07932

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 11 of 14

The foregoing Consent Agreement In the Matter of **Troy Corporation**, Docket Number **FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)** Is Hereby Stipulated, Agreed and Approved for Entry.

FOR COMPLAINANT:

Carol L. Kemker Director Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division U.S. EPA Region 4

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 12 of 14

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4

In the Matter of:

Troy Corporation

Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

FINAL ORDER

Respondent.

The Regional Judicial Officer is authorized to ratify this Consent Agreement which memorializes a settlement between Complainant and Respondent. 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.4(b) and 22.18(b)(3). The foregoing Consent Agreement is, therefore, hereby approved, ratified and incorporated by reference into this Final Order in accordance with the *Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits*, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

The Respondent is hereby ORDERED to comply with all of the terms of the foregoing Consent Agreement effective immediately upon filing of this Consent Agreement and Final Order with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order disposes of this matter pursuant to 40 C.F.R. \S 22.18 and 22.31.

BEING AGREED, IT IS SO ORDERED

Tanya Floyd Regional Judicial Officer

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 13 of 14

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that the foregoing "Consent Agreement" and "Final Order," in the Matter of [**Troy Corporation**, Docket No. **FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)**, were filed and copies of the same were emailed to the parties as indicated below.

Via email to all parties:

To Respondent: Adrian Krygsman, Director of Product Registration, krygsmaA@troycorp.com

To EPA: Kanoelehua Ho, Life Scientist, ho.kanoelehua@epa.gov,

and Robert Caplan, Senior Attorney, caplan.robert@epa.gov

Date

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, SW Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 (404) 562-9511

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-04-2020-0714(b)

Page 14 of 14